## Course Syllabus

**Course Syllabus**

**Fall 2024**

**Health and Global Security**

**PA 388K (60255); LAW 371V (114198); WGS**

FACULTY Jacqueline L. Angel, Ph.D TIME Monday, 9am -noon

PLACE LBJ School, SRH 3.212

OFFICE HOURS Tuesday, 10-11 am, SRH 3.239 and by appointment on-line or in- person. You may also drop by to see if I am in or contact me in advance to meet with me. E-MAIL jangel@austin.utexas.edu

VOICE 512.471.2956

This course introduces students to a variety of analytic approaches in the policy making process and investigates the legal frameworks that constrain and determine policy implementation. We pay particular attention to the major players in the process, and how health, in conjunction with global security, has become more salient in policy formation and implementation. The class will examine the social, political, and legal dimensions of the health care industry, and identify institutional and structural barriers to health care access for different groups. Why, for example, does the United States lack universal health care coverage? Given the centrality of security challenges posed by disease in different nations and regions of the world, we will investigate more broadly how nations respond to those threats. We will assess the role of international treaties and conventions in controlling the spread of diseases such as COVID-19 and the extent to which they are successfully implemented in different nations. Numerous problems in controlling the threat of disease arise from the fact of national sovereignty. International borders do not constrain the spread of infectious disease, yet there is no international authority to mandate a response.

Although modern medicine has been fabulously successful at treating and even curing acute disease, our initial hope that bacteria, viruses, and fungi could be eradicated today seems naive. COVID-19 is only the most recent reminder that we cannot become complacent. Other disease such as Ebola, Marburg, Chikungunya, West Nile, and Hanta viruses are a few diseases with high mortality rates that plague Humanity. Each year new viruses emerge from animal

reservoirs. Although antibiotics led us to become confident that we could defeat bacterial illnesses, drug resistant strains of old killers pose major risks to humanity. The scourges of Tuberculosis, syphilis, and other killers threaten the lives of millions of people. Such diseases raise ethical and legal questions as to society’s right to quarantine individuals involuntarily or mandatory vaccination. Gaps in knowledge and controversies concerning risks and appropriate treatments have specific consequences that we will debate.

We will also discuss policies dealing with mental health. The introduction of anti-psychotic and anti-depressant treatments in the 1950s provided hope for those who suffer serious mental and emotional illness. They also introduced important civil rights and legal issues related to involuntary treatment and commitment. Newer versions of those treatments are constantly underdevelopment. During the 20th Century life expectancy at birth and at older ages increased rapidly in all nations, although significant differences between the developing and developed nations persist. A collection of readings will allow us to discuss the economic, political, and social costs of illness for individuals, institutions, governments, and nations and how organizations, such as the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC), the World Health Organization (WHO) and other national and multilateral organizations respond to diseases that do not respect national borders.

Throughout the course, we examine the nature of acute and chronic disease and its impact on developing and developed societies. To do this we review basic epidemiological concepts and the factors that influence the way in which different diseases spread. In a highly urbanized and globalized world diseases that originate in one locality can within weeks and months become global pandemics. Pandemics, such as COVID-19 pose serious threats to local and national economies and can exacerbate existing conflicts among different groups. Illness, then, represents as serious a potential threat to our personal, family, community, and national security as weapons of mass destruction.

## **Required Book**

Gostin, Lawrence, O. 2021. *Global Health Security: A Blueprint for the Future*. Harvard University Press. Available at [https://www.amazon.com/Global-Health-Security-Blueprint-](https://www.amazon.com/Global-Health-Security-Blueprint-Future-ebook/dp/B097S1VCX3/ref%3Dtmm_kin_swatch_0?_encoding=UTF8&qid&sr) [Future-ebook/dp/B097S1VCX3/ref=tmm\_kin\_swatch\_0?\_encoding=UTF8&qid=&sr=Links to](https://www.amazon.com/Global-Health-Security-Blueprint-Future-ebook/dp/B097S1VCX3/ref%3Dtmm_kin_swatch_0?_encoding=UTF8&qid&sr) [an external site.](https://www.amazon.com/Global-Health-Security-Blueprint-Future-ebook/dp/B097S1VCX3/ref%3Dtmm_kin_swatch_0?_encoding=UTF8&qid&sr)

**Recommended**

Elbe, Stefan. 2010. *Security and Global Health* by Stefan Elbe (Polity Press). Gostin, Lawrence, O. 2014. *Global Health Law*. 2014. Harvard University Press.

## Format

The class will follow a fairly standard format and consist of readings with group discussion and presentations related to specific areas of health and global security. Weekly readings will be listed on the course syllabus in Canvas ([http://canvas.utexas.eduLinks to an external site.](http://canvas.utexas.edu/)). Each week a group of volunteers will serve as discussion leaders and will change the reading list as they deem appropriate. Read *Global Health Security: A Blueprint for the Future* at your own pace. We will discuss these topics as the semester proceeds with supplemental material and devote a class (or most of the class) to those of particular interest to you. There will be opportunities for reflection posts and comments on the Canvas Discussion Board: This discussion board is a place for you to reflect on the week’s readings and in-class discussions.

Additionally, this is a place for you to start building your policy brief.

## Assignments

The course will be organized as a combination of class discussion, peer critique and reflection, and application sessions. Your course grade will be determined on the basis of the following requirements:

1. A class briefing of a set of articles that will entail the following: describing the objectives of the article, identifying the primary motivation giving rise to the research noting the strengths and weaknesses of supporting evidence, and preparing at least two questions from the article that have policy development and implementation relevance. Each member of the group, consisting of two to three students, will make a class presentation regarding their own interpretation of the issue. Collectively, we will arrive at some conclusion based on the discussion. See Appendices A and B for principles of class discussion.
2. *Mid-term assessment*. The goal of this essay exam is to provide a strong incentive for you to review the class readings, lectures, and your own notes. It provides an opportunity to synthesize what you have learned in this seminar and make it uniquely your own.
3. *Approximately 8-page Issues Brief* involving an analysis of a health and global security The topic will be chosen by the student team early in the semester and approved by the instructor. Alternatively, students may elect to work on a legislative research project during the course. **Due last day of class**.

## Grading

Assignments include a policy discussion paper (40%) and two oral issue briefings (30%). Attendance and participation are integral parts of the course and will count towards the final grade (30%). A mid-term essay assessment will be administered to gauge class understanding of policy development concepts in context. This will be graded on a credit/no credit basis.

Assignments are to be submitted electronically on the class canvas. Click on the "assignment" tab and label it with your Last Name. Be sure to select "Attach Document" before clicking on "Submit" document.

## Important Notices

1. Services for Students with Disabilities

The university is committed to creating an accessible and inclusive learning environment consistent with university policy and federal and state law. If you are a student with a disability, or think you may have a disability, and need accommodations please contact Services for Students with Disabilities (SSD). Please refer to the Division of Diversity and Community Engagement SSD’s website for contact and more

information: [http://diversity.utexas.edu/disability/. Links to an external site.](http://diversity.utexas.edu/disability/)If you are already registered with SSD, please deliver your Accommodation Letter to me as early as possible in the semester so we can discuss your approved accommodations and needs in this course.

1. Academic Integrity

Students must be aware of the UT Honor Code (or statement of ethics) available

at: https://deanofstudents.utexas.edu/conduct/standardsofconduct.php. Academic dishonesty includes plagiarism which is the use of any citation, information, or idea that is obtained on-line or from published material without full citation. Examples of the appropriate citation of different materials will be provided in class.

1. Accommodations for Religious Holidays

UT Austin requires that if a student intends to miss class in observance of a religious holiday he or she must notify the instructor at least fourteen days in advance. If a student must miss a class, an examination, a work assignment, or a project in order to observe a religious holy day, he or she will be given an opportunity to complete the work within a reasonable time after the absence.

1. Title IX Reporting

Senate Bill 212 (SB 212), which went into effect January 1, 2020, requires all employees at a public or private post-secondary institution to promptly report any knowledge of any incidents of sexual assault, sexual harassment, dating violence, or stalking that has been disclosed to

them [https://statutes.capitol.texas.gov/Docs/ED/htm/ED.51.htm#51.255 Links to an external](https://statutes.capitol.texas.gov/Docs/ED/htm/ED.51.htm#51.255) [site.](https://statutes.capitol.texas.gov/Docs/ED/htm/ED.51.htm#51.255)I and my TA for this class are mandatory reporters and must share with the Title IX office any information about sexual harassment/assault shared with us by a student whether in-person or other class assignment. Note that a report to the Title IX office does not obligate a victim to take any action, but this type of information cannot be kept strictly confidential except when shared with designated confidential

employees. A confidential employee is someone a student can go to and talk about a Title IX matter without triggering that employee to have to report the situation to have it automatically investigated. If you would like to speak with someone who can provide support or remedies without making an official report to the university, please email advocate@austin.utexas.edu. For more information about reporting options and resources, visit [http://www.titleix.utexas.edu/Links](http://www.titleix.utexas.edu/) [to an external site.,](http://www.titleix.utexas.edu/) contact the Title IX Office via email at titleix@austin.utexas.edu, or call 512- 471-0419.

## University Resources for Students

Contact University Health Services [https://healthyhorns.utexas.edu/ Links to an external site.](https://healthyhorns.utexas.edu/)if you feel physically unwell.

Contact the Counseling and Mental Health Center [https://cmhc.utexas.edu/ Links to an external](https://cmhc.utexas.edu/) [site.](https://cmhc.utexas.edu/)if you need counseling or psychiatric services.

Visit the Longhorn Wellness

Center [https://www.healthyhorns.utexas.edu/healthpromotion.htmlLinks to an external site.](https://www.healthyhorns.utexas.edu/healthpromotion.html) for tips and things to consider as you take care of yourself and others during this time.

# CLASS ATTENDANCE

The class meets once a week and attendance is required. It is especially important to attend because one-quarter of your final grade is based on class participation. In general, acceptable reasons for absence from class include illness, serious family emergencies, military obligation, and religious holidays.

## Weekly Topics and Selected Readings

The following is a tentative schedule of what we will cover to help you keep up with your reading and assignments. Some of the topics will go faster than others and may vary because of new and emerging policy developments so we may deviate from the schedule substantially. In addition, you will be engaging in on-line searches of articles and government documents with your peers on various topics, posting findings and opinions, and responding to each other's interpretations of data on canvas. Each week’s seminar includes a Round-Robin Reflections (RRR) on the readings. Prior to class, each student will provide a summary of key arguments in the reading, and its significance (aim 1), analysis of how the week’s readings relate to other course and outside texts (aim 2), and a critical assessment of the week’s reading (aim 3). Note in the last prompt, address the following questions: What was most persuasive? What was least persuasive? Which are the issues and questions that need more attention? What kind of new research do the readings inspire? Submit your essay to Canvas. Please feel free to discuss with me anything about the seminar, as we proceed, either immediately after class or during my office hours.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Date** | **Topic**At issue: What is policy development? | **Reading** |
| **8/26** | Round Robin readings; submit your reflection essay to Canvas\* |
| **9/2** Labor Day (no class)  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  **9/9****9/16** | At Issue; Has global health become over- securitized? What should be the future direction of global health thinking?At Issue: What would be the most policy for optimizing societal health? | The Over-securitization of Global Health: Changing the Terms ofDebate [https://academic.oup.com/ia/article/95/5/1093/5556752\Links to an](https://academic.oup.com/ia/article/95/5/1093/5556752/) [external site.](https://academic.oup.com/ia/article/95/5/1093/5556752/) Clare Wenham (2019) *International Affairs* 95:5.Jongeun You. Lessons from South Korea’s Covid-19 Policy Response, The *American Review of Public Administration*,2020. [https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/full/10.1177/0275074020943708Links](https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/full/10.1177/0275074020943708) [to an external site.](https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/full/10.1177/0275074020943708)The Great Debate- selected articles by students |
| **9/23** | At issue: As nations age, what are the mechanisms to explain variations in health and human needs? Man- made epidemics- chronic disease? | Leuprecht, Christian. “International Security Strategy and Global Population Aging.” *Journal of Strategic Security* 3, no. 4 (2010): 27-48. [https://henley-](https://henley-putnam.national.edu/wp-content/uploads/2017/01/International-Security-Strategy-and-Global-Population-Aging.pdf) [putnam.national.edu/wp-Links to an external](https://henley-putnam.national.edu/wp-content/uploads/2017/01/International-Security-Strategy-and-Global-Population-Aging.pdf)[site.](https://henley-putnam.national.edu/wp-content/uploads/2017/01/International-Security-Strategy-and-Global-Population-Aging.pdf) [content/uploads/2017/01/International-Security-Strategy-and-Links to](https://henley-putnam.national.edu/wp-content/uploads/2017/01/International-Security-Strategy-and-Global-Population-Aging.pdf) [an external site.](https://henley-putnam.national.edu/wp-content/uploads/2017/01/International-Security-Strategy-and-Global-Population-Aging.pdf) [Global-Population-Aging.pdfLinks to an external site.](https://henley-putnam.national.edu/wp-content/uploads/2017/01/International-Security-Strategy-and-Global-Population-Aging.pdf) |
|  |  | Why Population Matters to Security [https://pai.org/wp-content/upLinks to an](https://pai.org/wp-content/up) [external site.](https://pai.org/wp-content/up) loads/2013/01/Why-Population-Matters-to-Security.pdf |
| **9/30** | At issue: How is environmental degradation affecting human security. What are regional trends in global health? | Warming World: Why Climate Change Matters More Than AnythingElse. [https://search.lib.utexas.edu/discovery/fulldisplay?docid=cdi\_galeLinks](https://search.lib.utexas.edu/discovery/fulldisplay?docid=cdi_gale_infotraccpiq_545671140&context=PC&vid=01UTAU_INST%3ASEARCH) [to an external site.](https://search.lib.utexas.edu/discovery/fulldisplay?docid=cdi_gale_infotraccpiq_545671140&context=PC&vid=01UTAU_INST%3ASEARCH)[\_infotraccpiq\_545671140&context=PC&vid=01UTAU\_INST:SELinks to an](https://search.lib.utexas.edu/discovery/fulldisplay?docid=cdi_gale_infotraccpiq_545671140&context=PC&vid=01UTAU_INST%3ASEARCH) [external site.](https://search.lib.utexas.edu/discovery/fulldisplay?docid=cdi_gale_infotraccpiq_545671140&context=PC&vid=01UTAU_INST%3ASEARCH) [ARCH Links to an external site.](https://search.lib.utexas.edu/discovery/fulldisplay?docid=cdi_gale_infotraccpiq_545671140&context=PC&vid=01UTAU_INST%3ASEARCH)Joshua Busby (2018) *Foreign Affairs* 97:49-55. |
| **10/7** | At issue: What role can human rights law play in times of health emergencies? What role does gender play | A Human Rights-Based Framework to Assess Gender Equality in Health Systems: The Example of Zika Virus in the Americas. [https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC6427496/Links to](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC6427496/) [an external site.](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC6427496/)Carol Vlassoff and Ronald St John. “*Global Health Action* (2019) 11. |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | in global heath emergencies? | [A Gendered Human Rights Analysis of Ebola And Zika: Locating](https://academic.oup.com/ia/article/92/5/1041/2688120) [Gender in Global Health Emergencies](https://academic.oup.com/ia/article/92/5/1041/2688120) [https://academic.oup.com/ia/article/92/5/1041/2688120](https://academic.oup.com/ia/article/92/5/1041/2688120%20) Sara E. Davies and Belinda Bennett (2016) 92:5. |
| **10/14** | At issue: Does state sovereignty undermine responses to global health challenges?Does the WHO perpetuate western and colonia values? | Coronavirus: COVID-19: How China Deceived theWHO *https://www.theatlantic.com/politics/archive/2020/04/world-* [*health-organization-blame-pandemic-*](https://www.theatlantic.com/politics/archive/2020/04/world-health-organization-blame-pandemic-coronavirus/609820/)[*coronavirus/609820/*Links to an external site.](https://www.theatlantic.com/politics/archive/2020/04/world-health-organization-blame-pandemic-coronavirus/609820/) [Kathy Gilsinan Links to an](https://www.theatlantic.com/author/kathy-gilsinan/) [external site.](https://www.theatlantic.com/author/kathy-gilsinan/)(2020) *The Atlantic* 4:12*.* |
| WHO International Health Regulations [https://www.who.int/health-](https://www.who.int/health-topics/international-health-regulations#tab%3Dtab_1) [topics/international-health-site.](https://www.who.int/health-topics/international-health-regulations#tab%3Dtab_1) [regulations#tab=tab\_1](https://www.who.int/health-topics/international-health-regulations#tab%3Dtab_1)[China vs. the WHO: A Behavioural Norm Conflict in the SARS](https://academic.oup.com/ia/article/95/3/535/5426077)Christian Kreuder-Sonnen (2019) 95:3. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC7108605/> |
| **10/21** | At issue: Should we reframe global health threats? How has the relationship changed between politics and public health in Mexico and along the Texas border, for example? | Dr. Peter Ward, Invited SpeakerBio [https://lbj.utexas.edu/ward-peter-mLinks to an external site.](https://lbj.utexas.edu/ward-peter-m) [https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1\_RTt-Ur3s0](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1_RTt-Ur3s0%20Links%20to%20an%20external%20site)”Forging an academic global health partnership in Puebla, Mexico”(2020) [https://www.thelancet.com/journals/langlo/article/PIIS2214-](https://www.thelancet.com/journals/langlo/article/PIIS2214-109X%2820%2930154-6/fulltext) [109X(20)30154-6/fulltext](https://www.thelancet.com/journals/langlo/article/PIIS2214-109X%2820%2930154-6/fulltext)From Security to Risk: Reframing Global HealthThreats <https://academic.oup.com/ia/article/93/6/1313/4568585> |
| **10/28** | At issue: To what extent do donor politics dominate global health decisions? Do global health actors ignore cultural dynamics? | [Colin McInnes, Anne Roemer-Mahler (2017) 93: 6.](https://academic.oup.com/ia/article/93/5/1185/4098318) [Instrumentalizing AIDS Empowerment Discourses in Malawi.](https://academic.oup.com/ia/article/93/5/1185/4098318) And Zambia: An Actor-Oriented View Of DonorPolitics. <https://academic.oup.com/ia/article/93/5/1185/4098318>Emma-Louise Anderson, Amy S. Patterson (2017) 93:5. |
| **11/4** | Mid-term assessment |
| **11/11** |  |  |
|  | *At issue: Who should manage pandemics? Does the international community have a responsibility to intervene in global health issues?* | [*https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/books/NBK143067/ Links to an*](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/books/NBK143067/)[*external site.*](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/books/NBK143067/)*World Health Organization Pandemic Influenza Preparedness and Response: A WHO Guidance Document (2009), Reference.**Countries should prepare to manage COVID-19 closely for the next 2 years* [*https://www.paho.org/en/news/24-6-2020-countries-*](https://www.paho.org/en/news/24-6-2020-countries-)[*should-prepare-manage-covid-19-closely-next-2-*](https://www.paho.org/en/news/24-6-2020-countries-should-prepare-manage-covid-19-closely-next-2-years)[*year.*](https://www.paho.org/en/news/24-6-2020-countries-should-prepare-manage-covid-19-closely-next-2-years) *Pan American Health Organization (2020).* |
| **11/18** | At issue: How has the relationship between global health and security evolved since the end of the Cold War?b) What can superpowers do to manage biological threats? | [From Biodefence to Biosecurity: the Obama administration's](https://academic.oup.com/ia/article/88/1/131/2326496) Gregory D. Koblentz 88: 1(2012) [https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/22400153/Links to an](https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/22400153/) [external site.](https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/22400153/) |
| **11/15****11/25** | At issue: Is there a role for social science in global health? How political is global health?Thanksgiving Break | [What Contribution Can International Relations Make to the](https://academic.oup.com/ia/article/86/5/1167/2326427) [Evolving Global Health Agenda?](https://academic.oup.com/ia/article/86/5/1167/2326427) <https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/20882709/> |
| **12/2** | At issue: Oral Summation  | Final Briefing and Peer-Review Comments. |
| **12/9**  | Wrap-up, Review and Evaluation  | Final Brief Submission. |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |   |  |

Appendix A

## Principles for Class Discussion

The following guidelines are intended to facilitate our discussions. Some of them may sound obvious, but I believe that they need to be made explicit.

*Preparation for Class Discussions:* Above all: *do the reading, and do it carefully*. I have limited the course readings this semester; in return, I expect everyone to have done all of the readings for each class session. Discussions should revolve around the week’s readings, rather than the larger topic or something that one or more students find interesting. There can be a tendency in class discussion toward a “bull session” about the topic that is not informed by the readings. In this course, our discussions must *center* on the assigned texts. In addition, always come to class with at least one question written down. These questions do not need to be grandiose or profound -- they can deal with issues of clarification, meaning, interpretation, or reflect something you don’t understand. Always enter the discussion with something you’d like to learn from it.

*Comments & Brevity:* Not every comment needs to be earth-shattering. Students may feel intimidated in class discussion is because it seems that the only legitimate comments are those that show complete mastery of the subject matter. Yet, there is no such thing – we will all be bringing a different perspective to these readings, and will have points to make that others have not considered. Every comment that reflects an attempt to engage the material seriously is valuable; indeed, simple questions often turn out to be the most difficult to answer. Comments asking for a clarification of the readings or of previous comments are always appropriate. In addition, comments should be kept short and to the point. It’s always possible to add elaboration as necessary.

*Listening & Equity:* In a good class discussion, comments from different participants are linked one to another. A given point is followed up, and the discussion has continuity. In some discussions, however, comments become disconnected, because participants are not listening to each other and reflecting on what is actually being said, or are directing their comments to the instructor, rather than to classmates. We should attempt to maintain continuity in our comments

and discussion. While we should acknowledge that different exposures to the material, different experiences, and different personalities lead to different levels of active participation, it should be our *collective* goal to have as equitable participation as possible. If you feel that you have dominated discussion, try to go 20 minutes without speaking; if you haven’t participated in the discussion, try to ask one question or make one comment.

*Arguments, Competitiveness, Consensus*: Our discussions are meant to expose theoretical debates. We won’t all agree on a given issue. However, arguments and debates must at all times be grounded on respect for the other participants. Aggressiveness and competitiveness are simply not acceptable. While we won’t usually reach consensus, we should pursue “cooperative conflict”: theoretical advance that comes out of constructive but not antagonistic conflict.

*Discussion Leading:* In order for discussions to have continuity, equity, and the other dynamics mentioned above, it is necessary that the discussion leader take a strong role. The discussion leader needs to have the ability to tell someone to hold off a point that doesn’t relate to the current discussion, cut rambling points short, etc. However, participants have the responsibility of letting the student leader(s) know when too much monitoring is going on.

*Collective Self-Evaluation:* The success of a course is a collective responsibility of all participants. Professors (and discussion leaders) cannot waive magic wands to promote stimulating and practically useful discussion. It is essential that we treat the class as something under our collective control, and something that can be challenged and transformed. Any problems should be dealt with through open discussions. We can work together to make the class exactly what we hope it will be.

## Guidelines for Leading Class Discussion

You will be in charge of leading discussion of the course material for one week of class during the semester, either alone or with other students. You can structure discussion in any number of ways. However, all discussion leaders must aim for equitable participation from class members and provide discussion questions to class members a week in advance. In addition, keep in mind that at the end of each class session, I will take 10 minutes to summarize what we have learned.

Many discussion leaders prefer to begin class by reviewing the required reading for the week. This review should raise specific questions and issues for the week, and relate the material to previous readings and class discussions. This is a fine strategy, but your summary *should*

*not* take more than 5 minutes. Longer summaries take away from discussion of the material. Your job is not to lecture, but to lead discussion about the material. This discussion will lead to a

clearer understanding of the readings, or at least a clearer understanding of the complexity of the readings.

The discussion leader must take a strong role, to ensure that the discussion covers the material, and that there is equity and continuity in the discussion. One of the major concerns in leading discussion is to ensure that the environment is secure enough for people to ask questions and become involved. Discussion leaders should be vigilant about maintaining equitable participation. Be creative in thinking about how to sustain discussion and involve all class members in discussion. Feel free to use power-point slides, video, or other audio-visual materials.

## Appendix B

**WHAT IS A LITERATURE REVIEW?**

It is…. a critical survey of the literature on a specific topic. It should describe trends, relationships and gaps in the research, and details how the selected works enhance your understanding of the topic at large.

They provide:

* A depth of knowledge of the field of inquiry: facts, lingo, theories, important scholars, seminal works, trends, etc.
	+ An understanding of methodologies common to the field, and appropriate times to employ various
	+ Fine tuning of the scope of your research question. Usually it will help narrow to a specific problem/issue, but it may also show that you need to step back and look at a bigger problem/question/set of
	+ Reinforcement of the idea that your proposed research in needed
	+ Hypotheses or questions for further studies

It is NOT…. simply an annotated bibliography that summarizes and/or assesses each article.

There is not one, correct way to approach and write a literature review. They can be a stand- alone paper or part of a thesis/dissertation. Format and parameters can very between disciplines and assignments.

# CONDUCTING LITERATURE REVIEWS

1. **Choose a topic**
	* Determine a your topic, but consider it a bit fluid. Focus/direction may shift as you begin reading related
	* Think about your topic. Read a few encyclopedia articles. Then write down important concepts, keywords, theories, etc. You’ll use these to generate effective and focused database

## Identify the Literature

* + Determine which search tools you will use. Don’t just use one! You’ll find a list of library databases under the “Find Articles Using Databases” link on the library home
	+ Determine parameters: parameters and depth of coverage: Highlights vs. comprehensive review, current research vs. seminal works, quantitative vs. quantitative,
	+ For each search tool, determine the search phrases and limits that will provide the best results. Save or document this search! The best search for one database isn’t likely to be the best search in another
	+ Through this process, adjust your topic and/or keyword scope accordingly to achieve the best results.
	+ Know that you may need to conduct multiple searches in each database to catch all of the literature on your topic. Consider searching for distinct sets of literature that will each enlighten your knowledge of a very specific
	+ Try to identify the “seminal works” and important authors for your
	+ Don’t leave out the theory! Take the time to think broadly about and find articles that address theory related to your topic – especially if you’re writing a
	+ Keep a list of subject headings or keywords related to your topic. You’ll rely on these in searching and in development the conceptual outline for your
	+ Start saving your references!

## Analyze the Literature

* + Read the articles you have selected, and take notes!
	+ If your notes use the exact phrasing as the article, note it as such to avoid
	+ Categorize the articles, or parts of articles, as to which aspects of your topic they
	+ Note any lingo, definitions or theories you want to use, remember or investigate
	+ For each study, you may consider (among other things): problem definition/significance, author credentials, support evidence, methods, objectivity/bias, persuasiveness of arguments, theoretical frameworks, value/contribution to knowledge of the
	+ Try to determine the relationship of each source to other sources under review and its relationship to the topic at large. Identity commonalities, relationships and trends in

the literature. Also note any inconsistencies or unique contributions so you can later determine if there is cause for specifically addressing them in your

* + Note controversies and gaps in the literature, and consider why this may be

## Synthesize the Literature

* + Use your notes to determine major categories or sections of your
	+ Create an outline, and order your notes and articles to follow the flow of your outline.
	+ Begin writing by identifying the specific topic/problem, explaining why it is significant, describing any parameters you’ve used, and providing a general, brief overview of the literature. Then move into the categories you’ve
	+ Within each category of the review, plan to address trends, gaps, conflicts, methodologies, relevant theories,
	+ Provide as much detail as each study merits. They do not have to be presented
	+ Note when a particular work is “seminal” or especially important and
	+ Note when a study is a replication of another cited
	+ Minimize the use of lengthy quotes. Again, this is your critique of the literature, not a summary of the literature!
	+ Summarize periodically and again at the end, finally describing the “state of the research” on your topic and the directions the research needs to go.
	+ Include all mentioned literature in a works cited

# FINDING LITERATURE REVIEWS

Start at the Library Databases: [http://www.lib.utexas.edu/indexes/index.phpLinks to an external](http://www.lib.utexas.edu/indexes/index.php) [site.](http://www.lib.utexas.edu/indexes/index.php)

* + **Annual Reviews Online -** Lengthy lit reviews, written by experts on the topic. Only select topics are
	+ **Dissertation Abstracts –** Full text dissertations. Each contains a lit review!
	+ **PsycINFO & Medline:** Let you limit your results to literature reviews. Look for the place to limit by
	+ **Other databases:** Cannot limit specifically to literature reviews, but add this line to your search*: “literature review” OR “review of the literature”*

# CITATION MANAGEMENT

* + Create an account with the databases you most often use. Most will allow you to save searches and
	+ **EndNote Web** (free): [https://www.myendnoteweb.comLinks to an external site.](https://www.myendnoteweb.com/)
	+ **EndNote** (purchase at the Campus Computer

Store): [http://www.lib.utexas.edu/services/instruction/endnote.htmlLinks to an](http://www.lib.utexas.edu/services/instruction/endnote.html) [external site.](http://www.lib.utexas.edu/services/instruction/endnote.html)

# LITERATURE REVIEW GUIDES

**eBooks:**

* + Conducting Research Literature Review
	+ Synthesizing Research: A Guide for Literature Reviews

## Print Books:

* + An Education Research Primer: How to Understand, Evaluate, and Use it:
	+ Conducting Research Literature Reviews: From Paper to the Internet: Preparing Literature Reviews:
	+ Writing Literature Reviews: A Guide for Students of the Social and Behavioral Sciences:
	+ Writing Empirical Research Reports:

## Web Sites:

* + Guidelines for Writing A Literature Review (University of Minnesota, Duluth)
		- [http://www.duluth.umn.edu/~hrallis/guides/researching/litreview.htmlLin](http://www.duluth.umn.edu/~hrallis/guides/researching/litreview.html) [ks to an external site.](http://www.duluth.umn.edu/~hrallis/guides/researching/litreview.html)
	+ Literature Reviews (University of North Carolina, Writing Center):
		- [http://www.unc.edu/depts/wcweb/handouts/literature\_review.htmlLinks to](http://www.unc.edu/depts/wcweb/handouts/literature_review.html) [an external site.](http://www.unc.edu/depts/wcweb/handouts/literature_review.html)
	+ Writing Literature Reviews (Claremont Graduate University, Writing Center):
		- [http://www.cgu.edu/pages/899.aspLinks to an external site.](http://www.cgu.edu/pages/899.asp)
	+ Writing a Psychology Literature Review (University of Washington, Psychology Writing Center):
		- [http://depts.washington.edu/psywc/handouts/pdf/litrev.pdfLinks to an](http://depts.washington.edu/psywc/handouts/pdf/litrev.pdf) [external site.](http://depts.washington.edu/psywc/handouts/pdf/litrev.pdf)

Source: University of Texas Libraries

## Appendix C

Peer-Review Evaluation

Is the class session organized well?

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| - Relates material to previous course readings | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |  |
| - Provides internal summaries and transitions | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |  |
| - Maintains continuity in the discussion | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |  |
| - Summarizes and distills main points at end of | class | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| - Paces class session appropriately |  | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| How is the substantive content discussed? |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| - Presents background information for ideas |  | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| - Integrates readings into discussion | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |  |
| - Helps clarifies material/corrects misunderstandings |  | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Is the discussion leader credible in her/his role? Does s/he present the material well? |  |
| - Appears well-prepared | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |  |
| - Understands the material | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |  |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| - Is able to admit insufficient knowledge | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |  |
| - Speaks audibly and clearly | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |  |
| - Communicates enthusiasm | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |  |
| How is the discussion leader’s rapport with the other class members? |
| - Recognizes when others are confused | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |  |
| - Encourages equitable participation | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |  |
| - Encourages class members to respond to one | another | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| - Requires class members’ thought and participation | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| - Responds constructively to class members | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| - Treats members equitably and respectfully | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| - Requires respect between class members | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |

Source: With permission adapted from Joya Misra, University of Massachusetts, Amherst.